Census Scientific Advisory Committee (CSAC) 2022 Fall Virtual Meeting

Minutes of September 29-30, 2022

Day 1 - (11:00am - 2:50pm)

Day 2 - (11:00am - 5:00pm)

Advisory Committee Members:

Name	Email	Committee	Location	Attendance
Census Scientific Advisory Committee				18
Deborah Balk	Deborah.Balk@baruch.cuny.edu	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Claire Bowen	cbowen@urban.org	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Frank Jay Breidt	jbreidt@gmail.com	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Thomas Brunell	tbrunell@gmail.com	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
William Clark	wac34@PSU.edu	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
John Czajka	jczajka@mathematica-mpr.com	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Barbara Entwisle	entwisle@unc.edu	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Gwynne Evans-Lomayesva	GEvansLomayesva@gmail.com	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Mario Marazzi	marazzi.m@gmail.com	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Mainak Mazumdar	Mainak.mazumdar@nielsen.com	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Jessica McKellar	jesstess@pilot.com	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Kristin Anderson Moore	kmoore@childtrends.org	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Ronald Prevost	Ronald.prevost@georgetown.edu	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Rogelio Saenz	Rogelio.saenz@utsa.ed	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Seth Spielman	Seth.spielman@colorado.edu	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Chad Syverson	chad.syverson@chicagobooth.edu	CSAC	Virtual	
Kunal Talwar	kunal@kunaltalwar.org	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Deepinder Uppal	DeepSingUppal@icloud.com	CSAC	Virtual	
Lance Waller	lwaller@emory.edu	CSAC	Virtual	\boxtimes
Richelle Winkler	rwinkler@mtu.edu	CSAC	Virtual	

Presenters and SMEs: Tommy Wright, Designated Federal Officer, CSAC

F. Jay, Chair of CSAC

Robert Santos, Director, Census Bureau Ron Jarmin, Deputy Director, Census Bureau

Jason Devine, Population Division Matthew Spence, Population Division Alexandra Krause, Population Division

Michael Hawes, Center for Enterprise Dissemination

Nicholas Jones, Population Division Rachel Marks, Population Division

Mark Mather, Population Reference Bureau

Eloise Parker, Demographic Programs
Gary Benedetto, Center for Enterprise Dissemination
Kyra Linse, Current Population Survey
Marc Perry, Population Division
Christine Hartley, Population Division
Paul Bucchioni, Economic Indicators Division
Richelle Winkler, CSAC Member

Advisory Committee Branch:

Kimberly Leonard Shana Banks Antonio "Tony" Ellis Helen Abraham

Call to Order: The meeting was called to order at 11:00 AM by Tommy Wright, Designated Federal Officer for CSAC.

Topics Discussed:

Update on the 2020 Census Data Products

- This topic will provide an update on the 2020 Census Data Products development, review the Round 2 2010 Demonstration Data metrics, likely present on the re-identification attack on the Round 2 2010 Demonstration Data, and provide an update on the Group II (Detailed DHC-A) product.
- o Census Bureau received 25 recommendations on this topic.

• Improving Disclosure Protections on the Current Population Survey Public Use File

- This topic will provide an overview of the agency's plan, including consideration of comments and recommendations received from the data user community over the summer. The agency's proposal is designed to introduce new protections in a manner that preserves the value of this important data resource for a wide range of data users.
- The Census Bureau received 7 recommendations on this topic.

Briefing on the Base Evaluation and Research Team

- Overview on the National Statistics 2020 Census Data Products
- Census Bureau received 6 recommendations on this topic.

• New Price Adjusted Economic Indicator Data

- The purpose of the "New Price Adjusted Economic Indicator Data" topic is to receive feedback on the quality and usefulness of this new product. This fall, the Census Bureau is issuing price adjusted economic indicator data as an experimental product for the wholesale sector, giving data users better perspective and insight into changes in the monthly estimates while considering inflationary pressures. The long-term vision is to price adjust data across the indicators.
- o Census Bureau received 5 recommendations on this topic.

Differential Privacy Working Group Deliverable – Tasks 1-3

- To support the Census Bureau's efforts to address the issue outlined above, including work on both the primary and secondary disclosure avoidance systems, the Census Bureau Director is establishing working groups for the National Advisory Committee (NAC) and the Census Scientific Advisory Committee (CSAC). Independent NAC and CSAC "Implementing Differential Privacy for the 2020 Census Data Products" working groups will develop separate recommendations, but will work collaboratively, and will each produce the deliverables described below. The working groups will assist with the main tasks, described below.
 - Task 1. Developing a summary of use cases.
 - Task 2. Developing recommendations for prioritizing use cases for the administration of a "privacy-loss budget."

- > Task 3. Developing metrics to assess the impact of differential privacy on the accuracy of decennial census data.
- o Census Bureau received 20 recommendations on this topic.

AGENDA: See below

Action Items / Information Requests / Follow up:

- CSAC is interested in the overall modernization of Census Bureau processes, especially the Bureau's
 vision of moving toward a data-centric enterprise organized around use cases and estimation targets
 and drawing on multiple sources of information.
- CSAC would like to see the Census Bureau publish extensive 2010 summary metrics based on the final
 parameter values in order to communicate to users the wide variation in accuracy that will characterize the
 published 2020 data.
- CSAC would like the Census Bureau to produce, publicly release, and submit for peer-review a detailed technical document describing the methods and results for their simulated reconstruction and reidentification attack on the Demographic and Housing Characteristics file, and addressing critiques of this reconstruction attack.
- CSAC would like the Census Bureau to make use of other forms of communication such as YouTube videos, Ted Talks, video vignettes, etc. on its website to reach a broader range of audiences, especially students.
- CSAC would like the Census Bureau to involve an independent group of data users with Special Sworn Status to assess the impact of the Current Population Survey (CPS) disclosure protection changes and giving the group sufficient time, data access, and resources to conduct the assessment.
- CSAC would like the Census Bureau to engage with other stakeholder groups beyond those already engaged by the U.S. Census Bureau, such as members of the National Bureau of Economic Research, Inter-university Consortium for Political and Social Research, Pew Research, Tax Policy Center, the Population Association of America, the Rural Sociological Society, and Rural Population Research Network, National Congress of American Indians, and the US Indigenous Data Sovereignty Network.
- CSAC would like the Census Bureau to initiate a CSAC working group on the Base Evaluation and Research Team (BERT), the Population Estimates Program, and the Population Estimates Challenge Program and provide frequent briefings.
- CSAC would like the Census Bureau to enhance its outreach efforts and provide training on 2020 Post Census Group Quarters Review to engage governments representing smaller populations.
- CSAC propose that for Census 2030 and all other Census data products (including the American Community Survey), the Census Bureau should have a clear, well-tested, practical, detailed, and step-by-step plan for how the disclosure avoidance system (DAS) system will be applied for each data product and how such application at each level will impact other products/levels prior to collecting any data.

Adjournment: The meeting was adjourned on September 29, 2022, at 2:50 PM by Tommy Wright, Designated Federal Officer of CSAC. Committee deliberations continued offline until 5:00 PM. On September 30, 2022, the committee deliberated from 2:05 PM to 4:30 PM to discuss and develop recommendations. The meeting reconvened at 4:30 PM at which time the CSAC 2022 Fall Virtual Meeting recommendations were presented. The meeting was adjourned at 5:00 PM by Tommy Wright, Designated Federal Officer of CSAC.

Census Scientific Advisory Committee – 2022 Fall Virtual Meeting U.S. Census Bureau September 29 – 30, 2022 11:00am – 5:00pm ET

Thursday, September 29, 2022

11:00 AM Opening Remarks

Tommy Wright, Designated Federal Officer, Census Scientific Advisory

Location: Virtual Meeting

Committee
Chair Remarks

F. Jay Breidt, Chair, Census Scientific Advisory Committee

Executive Remarks

Robert L. Santos, Director, U.S. Census Bureau Ron Jarmin, Deputy Director, U.S. Census Bureau

12:00 PM Update on the 2020 Census Data Products

Presenters: Jason Devine, Population Division

Matthew Spence, Population Division Alexandra Krause, Population Division

Michael Hawes, Center for Enterprise Dissemination

Nicholas Jones, Population Division Rachel Marks, Population Division

Mark Mather, Population Reference Bureau

CSAC Discussant: John Czajka and Committee Discussion

1:35 PM *BREAK*

1:45 PM Improving Disclosure Protections on the Current Population Survey Public Use

File

Presenters: Eloise Parker, Demographic Programs

Gary Benedetto, Center for Enterprise Dissemination

Kyra Linse, Current Population Survey

CSAC Discussant: Claire Bowen and Committee Discussion

2:50 PM *BREAK*

3:00 PM CSAC Committee Discussion and Formulation of Recommendations

Moderator: F. Jay Breidt, Chair, Census Scientific Advisory Committee

5:00 PM Meeting Adjourned

Tommy Wright, Designated Federal Officer



Census Scientific Advisory Committee – 2022 Fall Virtual Meeting U.S. Census Bureau September 29 – 30, 2022 11:00am – 5:00pm ET

Friday, September 30, 2022

11:00 AM Opening Remarks

Tommy Wright, Designated Federal Officer, Census Scientific Advisory

Location: Virtual Meeting

Committee
Chair Remarks

F. Jay Breidt, Chair, Census Scientific Advisory Committee

11:10 AM Briefing on the Base Evaluation and Research Team

Presenters: Marc Perry, Population Division

Christine Hartley, Population Division

CSAC Discussant: Ron Prevost and Committee Discussion

11:50 AM New Price Adjusted Economic Indicator Data

Presenter: Paul Bucchioni, Economic Indicators Division CSAC Discussant: Mario Marazzi and Committee Discussion

12:30 PM *PUBLIC COMMENTS*

Submission Instructions/Process:

- Public comments may be emailed with the subject entitled "2022 CSAC Fall Virtual Meeting Public Comment"
- Electronically send public comments to shana.j.banks@census.gov
- The Designated Federal Officer, Tommy Wright, will read all submissions provided they are received before September 29 at noon and do not exceed two-minutes.
- Public comments received after the deadline will not be read but will be posted to the <u>CSAC website</u>.

12:50 PM *BREAK*

1:00 PM Differential Privacy Working Group Deliverable – Tasks 1-3

Working Group Deliverable: Richelle Winkler, CSAC Member

Committee Discussion

2:05 PM CSAC Committee Discussion and Formulation of Recommendations

Moderator: F. Jay Breidt, Chair, Census Scientific Advisory Committee



PUBLIC MEETING AGENDA

Census Scientific Advisory Committee – 2022 Fall Virtual Meeting U.S. Census Bureau September 29 – 30, 2022 11:00am – 5:00pm ET

Friday, September 30, 2022 (Cont.)

Location: Virtual Meeting

4:30 PM Presentation of 2022 CSAC Fall Virtual Meeting Recommendations

Presenter: F. Jay Breidt, Chair, Census Scientific Advisory Committee

5:00 PM Meeting Adjourned

Tommy Wright, Designated Federal Officer

